

**Before the  
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION  
Washington, D.C. 20554**

In the Matter of	)	
	)	
Federal-State Joint Board On Universal	)	CC Docket No. 96-45
Service	)	

**REPLY COMMENTS**

BellSouth Corporation, on behalf of itself and its wholly owned subsidiaries (“BellSouth”), hereby submits its Reply Comments in the above referenced proceeding.

1. In response to the Commission’s *Public Notice*, a broad consensus emerges from comments – the core services included in the current definition of universal service should not be modified at this time. Many carriers, regulatory commissions and end users see little justification for expanding the definition of supported services at this time.<sup>1</sup> Most commenters believe that universal service should not become a vehicle for anointing a particular technology<sup>2</sup> or forcing the deployment of advanced telecommunications services.<sup>3</sup>

2. BellSouth agrees that the definition of supported services should not be modified. Based on the statutory criteria for determining services to be included within the definition of universal service, circumstances are not sufficiently different from when the Joint Board established the list of services currently under the umbrella of universal service to require a

---

<sup>1</sup> See, e.g., Comments of Ad Hoc Telecommunications Users Committee, AT&T Wireless, Competitive Universal Service Coalition, Maryland Public Service Commission, and Sprint Corporation.

<sup>2</sup> See Ad Hoc Telecommunications Users Committee at 3-4; Cellular Telecommunications & Internet Association at 5-7; Sprint at 4-6.

change. BellSouth does not believe that there is a factual predicate to support either expanding or contracting the existing list of supported services.

3. Nevertheless, several commenters urge the Commission to modify the definition in a variety of ways. For example, a few parties believe that soft dial tone or warm line services should be added to the list of supported services.<sup>4</sup> As BellSouth explained in its comments, soft dial tone services should not be added to the core services covered by universal service support. Such services are not so widespread and subscribed to by the majority of residential customers as to fall within the parameters of the statutory criteria for universal service. To the extent that such services may or may not contribute to the public safety is a matter that is local in nature and better addressed at the state level. The fact that such services are not supported at the federal level would not preclude a state from including soft dial tone in a state universal service fund.

4. Further, no party that has advocated that the federal universal service fund support soft dial tone services even acknowledged cost and other implementation issues that abound. SBC identified the significant business and operational impact that including soft dial tone in the definition of universal service would have on local exchange carriers.<sup>5</sup> This one modification would require systems modifications, billing modifications, dedication of scarce numbering resources, and the development of new intercarrier and customer maintenance methods and procedures. Apart from the administrative burden, there would be a substantial implementation

---

<sup>3</sup> See, e.g., AT&T Corp. at 3-5, 7-12; Illinois Commerce Commission at 4-5; New York State Department of Public Service at 4-5; Qwest Communications International Inc. at 4-5.

<sup>4</sup> United States Conference of Catholic Bishops, Alliance for Community Media, Appalachian People's Action Coalition, Center For Digital Democracy, Consumer Action, the Community Technology Institute, Consumer Federation of America, Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition, the Migrant Legal Action Program, the National Coalition for the Homeless, the National Community Voice Mail Federation and Dr. Marcia Zashin, Education Consultant to the Cleveland Public Schools and Project Act at 4-13 ("Joint Commenters"); The People of the State of California and the California Public Utilities Commission at 3-5 ("CPUC"); Iowa Utilities Board at 6-7; Public Utility Commission of Texas at 4-5.

cost. For all of these reasons, the addition of soft dial tone to the list of supported services cannot be justified.

5. Some commenters reintroduce the idea that the bandwidth definition of voice grade service should be altered.<sup>6</sup> Tinkering with the definition of voice grade service is misguided. The purported aim of redefining voice-grade bandwidth is to ensure that rural subscribers can obtain dial-up Internet access at 28.8 kbps. When the issue was first considered, the record indicated that modification of the definition of voice grade access will not ensure that the modem connection between the end user and the Internet service provider will synchronize at 28.8 kbps. Many factors impact the speed at which two modems communicate. Simply changing the definition of voice grade bandwidth will not guarantee anything, let alone modem to modem synchronization at 28.8 kbps. Changing the bandwidth definition would not change the fact that there are neither industry standards nor specifications developed to support the changed definition. Without these parameters, the electrical performance of the “enhanced” bandwidth voice grade service could adversely impact other telecommunications services, including xDSL services. Even if these standards existed, this type of network change would be extremely costly without any guarantee of a public benefit. The absolute folly of such a requirement is that it would divert scarce resources from investment in technology to investment in technical alteration of existing technology.<sup>7</sup>

---

<sup>5</sup> SBC at 11-14.

<sup>6</sup> *See, e.g.*, Montana Universal Service Task Force at 6-7 (“MUST”); State of Alaska at 8-21.

<sup>7</sup> BellSouth at 5-6. The Florida Public Service Commission acknowledges that modifying the definition of voice grade access would unnecessarily disrupt the marketplace (p. 8). AT&T points out that modifying the definition of voice grade access could not pass muster as competitively neutral (pp. 5-7).

6. Equally inappropriate would be to modify the list of supported services to include equal access,<sup>8</sup> Expanded Area Service<sup>9</sup> and prepaid services.<sup>10</sup> None of these services satisfy the statutory criteria that the Commission must apply to justify including such services within the definition of universal service. These services are not essential to public health, safety or education or widely subscribed to by a majority of residential subscribers. Their inclusion as a supported service would not serve the public interest. As the Ad Hoc Telecommunications Users Committee warns, any expansion of the list of supported services brings with it the likelihood that the cost of basic telecommunications services will increase for all consumers. Such a consumer impact cannot be ignored.<sup>11</sup> Nevertheless, not one party suggesting that the list of supported services be expanded addresses consumer impacts beyond making unsupported assertions that the impact will be minimal. These arguments are not enough to justify modifying the list of supported services.

7. Rather than modifying the definition of universal service, the Joint Board and the Commission should focus on completing the unfinished tasks associated with universal service that remain. For example, implicit universal service subsidies remain in many state jurisdictions. As the Tenth Circuit Court of Appeals recently determined, the Commission has an obligation “to formulate its policies so as to achieve the goal of reasonable comparability by inducing ‘sufficient ... State mechanisms’ to do so.”<sup>12</sup> The Commission has not given the issue of implicit intrastate subsidies the attention that it requires. The Joint Board, instead of tampering with the definition of universal service, should look toward ways in which the Commission can

---

<sup>8</sup> See, e.g., OPASTCO at 3-5; MUST at 13-14.

<sup>9</sup> See, e.g., Joint Commenters at 13-20.

<sup>10</sup> *Id.* at 23-32.

<sup>11</sup> Ad Hoc Telecommunications Users Committee at 16-17. See also CPUC at 5-6.

effectuate the partnership contemplated in the Act between federal and state governments to support universal service.<sup>13</sup> Resources would be better used in crafting the inducements for states to act so as to preserve and advance universal service. The Commission has the responsibility to ensure that the states act.<sup>14</sup> Meeting that responsibility can be jeopardized by prematurely and unnecessarily altering the definition of universal service.

Respectfully submitted,

**BELLSOUTH CORPORATION**

By: /s/ Richard M. Sbaratta  
Richard M. Sbaratta

Its Attorney

Suite 4300  
675 West Peachtree Street, N. E.  
Atlanta, Georgia 30375-0001  
(404) 335-0738

Date: January 4, 2002

---

<sup>12</sup> *Qwest Corp. v. FCC*, 258 F.3d 1191, 1200 (10th Cir. 2001).

<sup>13</sup> *Id.* at 1203.

<sup>14</sup> *Id.* at 1204.

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I do hereby certify that I have this 4<sup>th</sup> day of January 2002 served the following parties to this action with a copy of the foregoing **REPLY COMMENTS** by electronic filing and/or by placing a copy of the same in the United States Mail, addressed to the parties listed on the attached service list.

/s/ Juanita H. Lee \_\_\_\_\_  
Juanita H. Lee

**Service List CC Docket No. 96-45**

+Magaline Roman Salas, Secretary  
Federal Communications commission  
The Portals, 445 Twelfth Street, S. W.  
Room TW-A325  
Washington, D.C. 20554

The Honorable Kathleen Q. Abernathy  
Commissioner  
Federal Communications Commission  
The Portals, 445 Twelfth Street, S. E.  
Suite 8-B204  
Washington, D. C. 20554

Nanette G. Thompson  
Chair  
Regulatory Commission of Alaska  
1016 West Sixth Avenue, Suite 400  
Anchorage, AK 99501-1693

Sheryl Todd  
Accounting Division  
Common Carrier Bureau  
Federal Communications Commission  
The Portals, 445 Twelfth Street, S. E.  
Room 5-B540  
Washington, D. C. 20554

The Honorable Michael J. Copps  
Commissioner  
Federal Communications Commission  
The Portals, 445 Twelfth Street, S. E.  
Suite 8-A302  
Washington, D. C. 20554

The Honorable Kevin J. Martin  
Commissioner  
Federal Communications Commission  
The Portals, 445 Twelfth Street, S. E.  
Suite 8-C302  
Washington, D. C. 20554

J. Thomas Dunleavy  
Commissioner  
New York Public Service Commission  
One Penn Plaza 8<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, New York 10119

Martha S. Hogerty  
Missouri Office Public Counsel  
301 West High Street, Suite 250  
Truman Building, P. O. Box 7800  
Jefferson City, MO 651-2

Lila A . Jaber  
Commissioner  
Florida Public Service Commission  
2540 Sumard Oak Blvd.  
Gerald Gunter Building  
Tallahassee, FL 32399-0866

Pat Wood, III  
Chairman  
Texas Public Utility Commission  
1701 North Congress Avenue  
P. O. Box 13326  
Austin, TX 78711

Bob Rowe  
Commissioner  
Montana Public Service Commission  
1701 Prospect Avenue  
P. O. Box 202601  
Helena, MT 59620-2601

+Qualex International  
The Portals, 445 Twelfth Street, S. E.  
Room CY-B42  
Washington, D. C. 20554

Lawrence G. Malone  
General Counsel  
New York State Department  
Of Public Service  
Three Empire State Plaza  
Albany, New York 12223-1350

Stephen A. Judycki  
3 Parkwood Drive  
Wilbraham, MA 01095-1323

Matthew D. Bennett  
Policy Director  
Alliance for Public Technology  
919 18<sup>th</sup> Street, NW  
Suite 900  
Washington, D.C. 20006

Alan W. Pedersen  
Vice President – Regulatory Affairs  
Pauahi Tower, 27<sup>th</sup> Floor  
1001 Bishop Street  
Honolulu, HI 96813



Maureen Trimm  
President  
ACUTA, Inc.  
152 West Zandale Drive, Suite 200  
Lexington, Kentucky 40503

Susan M. Gately  
Sarah C. Bosley  
Economic Consultants  
Economics and Technology, Inc.  
Two Center Plaza, Suite 400  
Boston, MA 92108-2617

James S. Blaszak  
The Ad Hoc Telecommunications  
Users Committee  
Levine, Blaszak, Block & Boothby, LLP  
2001 L Street, N. E., Suite 900  
Washington, D. C. 20036

James Rowe  
Executive Director  
Alaska Telephone Association  
201 E. 56<sup>th</sup>, Suite 114  
Anchorage, Alaska 99518

Howard J. Symons  
Sara F. Leibman  
Tara M. Corvo  
AT&T Corporation  
Mintz, Levin, Cohn, Ferris,  
Glovsky and Popeo, P. C.  
701 Washington Avenue, N. W.  
Washington, D. C. 2004

Mark Rosenblum  
Judy Sello  
AT&T Corporation  
Room 1135L2  
295 North Maple Avenue  
Basking Ridge, New Jersey 07920

Howard J. Symons  
Sara F. Leibman  
Bryan T. Bookhard  
AT&T Wireless Services, Inc.  
Mintz, Levin, Cohn, Ferris  
Glovsky and Popeo, P. C.  
701 Pennsylvania Avenue, N. W.  
Suite 900  
Washington, D. C. 20004

Douglas I. Brandon  
Vice President-External Affairs  
AT&T Wireless Services, Inc.  
1150 Connecticut Avenue, N. W.  
Washington, D. C. 20036

Carol Weinhaus  
President  
Coverging Industries  
Research Foundation  
Meeting House Offices  
121 Mount Vernon Street  
Boston, MA 02108

Michael F. Altschul  
Sarah E. Leeper  
Cellular Telecommunications &  
Internet Association  
1250 Connecticut Avenue, N. W.  
Suite 800  
Washington, D.C. 20036

Michele C. Farquhar  
David L. Sieradzki  
Ronnie London  
Competitive Universal Service Coalition  
Hogan & Hartson LLP  
555 13th Street, N. W.  
Washington, DC 2004

Gary M. Cohen  
Lionel B. Wilson  
Jonady Hom Sun  
People of the State of California  
And the California Public Utilities Commission  
505 Van Ness Avenue  
San Francisco, CA 94102

George N. Barclay  
Michael J. Ettner  
General Services Administration  
1800 F Street, N. W.  
Room 4002  
Washington, D. C. 20405

Snaveley King Majoros O'Connor  
& Lee, Inc.  
1220 L Street, N. W., Suite 410  
Washington, D. C. 20005

Myra Karegianes  
Sarah A Naumer  
Thomas G. Aridas  
Illinois Commerce Commission  
160 N. LaSalle, Suite C-800  
Chicago, Illinois 60601

Susan S. Miller  
Maryland Public Service Commission  
6 Saint Paul Street  
Baltimore, MD 21202

Michael C. Strand  
Counsel for MUST  
2021 11<sup>th</sup> Avenue – Suite 12  
Helena, Montana 59601

The Honorable Michael K. Powell  
Chairman  
Federal Communications Commission  
The Portals, 445 Twelfth Street, S. W.  
Suite 8-B-201  
Washington, D. C. 20554

Norman G. Curtright  
Sharon J. Devine  
Qwest Communications  
International Inc.  
Suite 700  
1020 19th Street, N. W.  
Washington, D. C. 20036

Stephen G. Kraskin  
Sylvia Lesse  
Marci E. Greenstein  
Rural Cellular Association  
2120 L Street, N. W.  
Suite 520  
Washington, D.C. 20037

Jeffry A. Brueggeman  
Gary L. Phillips  
Paul K. Mancini  
SBC Communications Inc.  
1401 Eye Street, N. W.  
Suite 400  
Washington, D. C. 20005

Jay C. Keithley  
Sprint Corporation  
401 9<sup>th</sup> Street, NW, #400  
Washington, DC 20004

Rick Zucker  
Brian Staihr, Ph.D.  
Sprint Corporation  
6360 Sprint Parkway  
KSOPHE0302  
Overland Park, KS 66252

Robert M. Halperin  
Bridget E. Calhoun  
Valerie Hinko  
The State of Alaska  
Crowell & Moring LLP  
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue, N. W.  
Washington, D. C. 20004

John W. Katz, Esquire  
Special Counsel to the Governor  
Director, State-Federal Relations  
Office of the State of Alaska  
Suite 336  
444 North Capitol Street, N. W.  
Washington, D. C. 20001

William L Fishman  
Telecommunications for the Deaf, Inc.  
Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman, LLC  
3000 K Street, N. W. Suite 300  
Washington, D. C. 20007-5116

Claude Stout  
Executive Director  
Telecommunications for the Deaf, Inc.  
8630 Fenton Street, Suite 604  
Silver Spring, MD 20910-3803

Margot Smiley Humphrey  
TDS Telecommunications Corporation  
Holland & Knight LLP  
2099 Pennsylvania Avenue  
Suite 100  
Washington, DC 20006

Richard A. Muscat  
Texas 9-1-1 Agencies &  
The National Emergency Number Association  
The Gonzalez Law Firm  
One Westlake Plaza  
1705 South Capitol of Texas Highway  
Austin, Texas 78746

Christopher R. Day  
Angela J. Campbell  
Institution for Public Representation  
Georgetown University Law Center  
600 New Jersey Avenue, N. W.  
Suite 312  
Washington, D. C. 20001

Judith A. Endejan  
WSBA# 11016  
United States Cellular Corporation  
Graham & Dunn, P.C.  
1420 Fifth Avenue, 33rd Floor  
Seattle, WA 98101

John W. Hunter  
Lawrence E. Sargeant  
Linda L. Kent  
Keith Townsend  
Julie E. Rones  
United States Telecom Association  
1401 H Street, N. W., Suite 600  
Washington, D. C. 2005

Henry Rivera  
Rodney L. Joyce  
Valor Telecommunications  
Enterprise, L. L. C.  
Shook, Hardy & Bacon, L.L.P.  
600 14<sup>th</sup> Street, N. W., Suite 800  
Washington, D. C. 20005-2004

William M. Ojile, Senior Vice President  
General Counsel & Secretary  
Valor Telecommunications Enterprises, LLC  
201 East John Carpenter Freeway  
Las Colinas Tower 1, Suite 200  
Irving, TX 75062

Joseph DiBella  
Verizon Telephone Companies  
1515 North Court House Road  
Room 411  
Arlington, VA 22201-2909

John T. Scott, III  
Charon J. Harris  
Stephen J. Berman  
Verizon Wireless  
1300 I Street, N. W.  
Suite 400 West  
Washington, D.C. 20005

Mary L. Brown  
Robert Lopardo  
Lori Wright  
WorldCom, Inc.  
1133 19<sup>th</sup> Street, N. W.  
Washington, D. C. 20036

David Lynch  
James R. Langenberg  
Iowa Utilities Board  
350 Maple Street  
Des Moines, IA 50319

Margot Smiley Humphrey  
NRTA  
Holland & Knight LLP  
2100 Pennsylvania Avenue, N. W.  
Suite 400  
Washington, D. C. 20037

Stuart Polikoff  
Stephen Pastorkovich  
Jeffrey Smith  
OPASTCO  
21 Dupont Circle, N. W.  
Suite 700  
Washington, D. C. 20036

Robert N. Felgar  
Community Voice Mail  
Dickstein Shapiro Morin  
& Oshinsky LLP  
2101 L Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20037-1526

**+ VIA ELECTRONIC FILING**